

Name: _____

Comparative Fiction Book Project
Peer Review Activity for Planning Page # _____

This review is for the Planning Page of _____.
(Partner's Name)

- Directions:** 1) Read your partner's Planning Page, making corrections to spelling and mechanics as needed. Use the Proofreading Marks guide on page 67 of your Reading & Writing Workshop packet.
- 2) Answer each of the questions below thoughtfully and thoroughly. The harder you work evaluating your partner's work, the better his/her final product will be and the more effort he/she will put into evaluating your work.

Peer Review Questions

1. Identification of Fictional Element

Has your partner circled the element of fiction that he/she will be comparing for this blog entry? (circle one)

Yes No

If your partner has circled the element of fiction that he/she will be comparing, what element of fiction was chosen? (circle one)

Setting	Narrator/Point of View	Characterization	Plot
Theme	Structure	Additional Elements	Language Use

2. Title and Author Identification

Has your partner recorded the <i>title</i> of Book #1? (circle one)	Yes	No
Has your partner recorded the <i>author(s)</i> of Book #1? (circle one)	Yes	No
Has your partner recorded the <i>title</i> of Book #2? (circle one)	Yes	No
Has your partner recorded the <i>author(s)</i> of Book #2? (circle one)	Yes	No

3. Direct Quotation for Book #1

Has your partner recorded <i>two direct quotes</i> from Book #1? (circle one)	Yes	No
Has your partner provided <i>page numbers</i> for both quotes? (circle one)	Yes	No

How effectively does your partner's *first quote* from Book #1 relate to the element of fiction he/she chose to compare? For example, if your partner chose to compare setting between his/her books, the recorded quotes should provide information about where and when the story takes place. (circle one)

5 4 3 2 1

Explain the *effectiveness* of your partner's first quote from Book #1. How does it relate to the element of fiction he/she chose? If the quote does not relate to the selected element of fiction, why not and what can your partner do to correct his/her work?

How effectively does your partner's *second quote* from Book #1 relate to the element of fiction he/she chose to compare? For example, if your partner chose to compare setting between his/her books, the recorded quotes should provide information about where and when the story takes place. (circle one)

5 4 3 2 1

Explain the *effectiveness* of your partner's second quote from Book #1. How does it relate to the element of fiction he/she chose? If the quote does not relate to the selected element of fiction, why not and what can your partner do to correct his/her work?

4. Direct Quotation for Book #2

Has your partner recorded *two direct quotes* from Book #2? (circle one) Yes No

Has your partner provided *page numbers* for both quotes? (circle one) Yes No

How effectively does your partner's *first quote* from Book #2 relate to the element of fiction he/she chose to compare? For example, if your partner chose to compare setting between his/her books, the recorded quotes should provide information about where and when the story takes place. (circle one)

5 4 3 2 1

Explain the *effectiveness* of your partner's first quote from Book #2. How does it relate to the element of fiction he/she chose? If the quote does not relate to the selected element of fiction, why not and what can your partner do to correct his/her work?

How effectively does your partner's *second quote* from Book #2 relate to the element of fiction he/she chose to compare? For example, if your partner chose to compare setting between his/her books, the recorded quotes should provide information about where and when the story takes place. (circle one)

5 4 3 2 1

Explain the *effectiveness* of your partner's second quote from Book #2. How does it relate to the element of fiction he/she chose? If the quote does not relate to the selected element of fiction, why not and what can your partner do to correct his/her work?

5. **Thesis Statement**

Has your partner written a thesis statement? (circle one) Yes No

Restate your partner's *thesis* in your own words.

Does your partner's thesis contain a **topic**? In this case, is the specific comparison and element of fiction named? (circle one)

Yes No

Does your partner's thesis contain a **statement**? In this case, does your partner mark a specific claim highlighting the differences and similarities of his/her two books use of the same element of fiction? (circle one)

Yes No

Does your partner's thesis include **complication**? In this case, is the claim being made arguable and in need of text-based support? (circle one)

Yes No

Does the thesis give your partner a strong foundation to organize a paper around? In this case, can your partner write a *strong comparison essay* for his/her blog entry? (circle one)

Yes No

If you answered "No" to any of the above questions for the thesis statement, explain what your partner's thesis statement is missing.
